Corporate Services Scrutiny Panel

PUBLIC MEETING

Record of Meeting

Date... **19th June 2008** Location....**Blampied Room** Meeting **No 67**

Present	Deputy P J D Ryan, Chairman
	Connétable D Murphy
	Connétable J L S Gallichan
	Deputy C Egré, Vice-Chairman
	Deputy R Le Hérissier
	Connétable P. Hanning (for items 4 and 7(c))
In attendance	Mr M. Haden, Scrutiny Officer

Ref Back	Agenda matter	
1	Minutes of meetings held on 8th, 15th and 28th May 2008 were approved and signed.	
2	Matters arising - Action update noted. The Panel requested a copy of a model efficiency statement from the Treasury.	
3.	Procurement Strategy	
Item 5 080508	The Panel welcomed the Director of Procurement to discuss progress with the Procurement Strategy. The Panel was briefed on:	
	The Centre Lead Action Network (CLAN) policy for devolving procurement strategies across the States organisation	
	The factors which have contributed to difficulties in implementing procurement disciplines through all departments	
	The activities of the Procurement Lead Group	
	 The reasons for the lack of savings in 2007 	
	The current targets for savings of £2.25 million	
	Staffing	
	The Panel thanked the Director for her informative briefing and requested access to copies of recent reports to the Corporate Management Board	МН
4	States Annual Business Plan: Financial Forecasting	
	The Panel welcomed Professor Michael Oliver to discuss his potential role in assisting with the monitoring the process and outcomes of the financial forecasts which are produced to inform the States Business Planning and Budgeting process.	
	In a briefing paper for the Panel Professor Oliver outlined six key	

	questions on how forecasting is conducted. In working with the Panel he	
	suggested that he would	
	 address the questions and draw upon and examine the experiences of other jurisdictions with relevance to Jersey 	
	 provide the panel with regular updates on the wider macroeconomic framework and how these might impact on the economic forecasts 	
	 offer advice on economic issues under the Sub Panel's remit. 	
	The Panel considered that it was important to examine more rigorously the assumptions made by the forecasting group and to question the current presentation of economic information. There needed to be some clarity on how to measure the success or failure of forecasts. The Panel suggested that the current forecasts did not demonstrate an adequate level of risk analysis and it believed that the public expected a more sophisticated debate on economic prospects.	
	The Panel noted that the Fiscal Policy Panel (FPP) would provide comments on the appropriateness of the States financial position and forecasts. The Panel considered that by scrutinising the financial forecasts it could complement and not duplicate the work of the FPP.	
	The Panel thanked Professor Oliver and he withdrew from attending the meeting.	
	Deputy R.G. Le Herissier, who was a colleague of Professor Oliver at Highlands, also withdrew from the meeting while the Panel considered whether to engage Professor Oliver as an adviser.	
	The Panel agreed that Professor Oliver could provide valuable economic expertise and that this would strengthen its ability to ask searching and relevant questions on the work being done on forecasting. It agreed therefore to engage Professor Oliver as adviser for the period of the remaining life of the Sub Panel (that is until the reappointment of Panels after the forthcoming elections). The Panel agreed that it would aim to prepare a report on forecasting to inform the debate on the States Budget in December.	
	The Scrutiny Officer was requested to draw up an estimate of expenditure for its consideration, together with a scope setting out clearly the terms of reference for the work to be undertaken by the adviser.	МН
5.	Review of States Spending: Report of Comptroller and Auditor General:	
	The Panel considered a briefing paper prepared by the Scrutiny officer on issues relevant to the Panel's remit. The Panel considered the following cross-cutting issues:	
	• Procurement (see item 3 above). The Panel agreed to give further consideration to procurement issues once it had received the reports requested from the Director of Procurement.	МН
	• Property management - The Panel noted issues regarding the funding of maintenance had been highlighted in the draft 2009 States Business Planning process. Deputy Egré informed the Panel that he had already had a number of private meetings with the Director of Property Holdings. He believed that it would be now appropriate to continue these meetings on behalf of the Panel on a formal basis. It was agreed to delegate responsibility for this matter	

	to Deputy Egré and Constable Murphy and the Scrutiny officer was requested to arrange a meeting with the Director of Property Holdings accordingly.	MH
	• IT Services - The Panel recalled that Deputy Egré was already in regular contact with the Director of IT Services and had previously reported on briefings to the Panel. Deputy Egré said that he would be investigating the issue of IT procurement procedures with the Director at their next meeting. The Panel agreed that this format of regular briefings was an appropriate form of monitoring progress with the IT strategy.	
	• Human Resources - The Panel decided to request a briefing meeting with the HR Director in the autumn session.	МН
	• Corporate Management : structure and resources of the Chief Minister's department. The Panel noted that the increasingly multiple responsibilities of the Chief Minister's department was having an impact on its own workload with issues such as Bovine Semen, Jersey Enterprise Board, Urban Regeneration, Civil Aviation coming within its remit.	
	The Panel also recalled that it had written to the Privileges and Procedures Committee regarding codifying the terms of reference, modus operandi and standards of conduct for the Corporate Management Board. The Panel agreed that further work should be done on this issue and agreed to revert to the Privileges and Procedures Committee.	MH
	The Panel noted that a briefing paper had already been submitted to the Chairmen's Committee outlining the above matters.	
6	Current Reviews	
	The Panel noted an update summary of current reviews and the following additional matters:	
	(a) Jersey Enterprise Board - The Chief Executive had invited the Panel's adviser to participate in a workshop on revised proposals; however, it was agreed that this would not be appropriate as it would compromise a Scrutiny review of any further proposals.	
	(b) Bovine Semen - Certain members of the Sub Panel were keen to investigate an alternative conservationist option which had been suggested by the Panel adviser; however, this was not expected to delay the report beyond the promised deadline. The Chairman said that the Sub Panel would make every effort to achieve a comprehensive report within the timescale and without compromising the quality of the review.	
	(c) Finance Sub Panel - The Panel noted the date for the next presentation of the States Business Plan (14th July) and a further briefing (21st July) which would provide an opportunity for States members to hear Ministers present and explain the key objectives for their department that are being proposed in the draft Annual Business Plan 2009. The Sub Panel had agreed to meet after this briefing for a discussion with its adviser on the strengths and weaknesses of the Business Planning process to date. The Scrutiny Officer was requested to ask the adviser to prepare a short briefing paper on this subject to be followed by a more	
	detailed analysis following their discussion.	MH
7	Land Transactions Tax	
Item 6	(a) The Panel considered the review evaluation report prepared by	

090408	the Scrutiny Officer and agreed to forward it to the Chairmen's Committee.	МН
	(b) The Panel considered a summary of evidence received in respect of commercial property transactions. It was agreed to formally request the Treasury and Resources Minister to inform the Panel how he was going to progress this project.	МН
8.	Matters for noting:	
	Briefing Notes of Chairmen's Committee meeting on 23rd May 2008 - The Panel noted the Chairmen's Committee request to consider the proposal for an away day for Scrutiny members to consider the Internal Review into Working Practices but agreed that this was not required.	
	Forthcoming draft legislation - The Panel noted P.79/2008, P.80/2008 and P.81 relating to draft Regulations on confiscation orders and external forfeiture orders and agreed that they did not require scrutinising.	
	The Panel also noted P.90/2008 (draft Food Costs (Offset of Average GST) Bonus (Jersey) Regulations 200-). The Chairman indicated that he had certain concerns with this item.	PR
	Ministerial decisions in May - The Panel noted the Treasury and Resources Minister's proposition on funding for the Child Abuse enquiry. It agreed to request the Public Accounts Committee to consider requesting the Comptroller and Auditor General to review these costs.	MH
	ITIS - The Chairman informed the Panel that he would be meeting Mr. Hamel and associates to discuss concerns regarding ITIS.	PR
	Date of next meeting - 1st August 2008 - The Panel agreed to cancel the meeting scheduled for 4th July due to the current workload on individual reviews and States sittings.	

Signed

Date

Chairman, Corporate Services Panel

.....